SHRI N. JOTHI: We have done both. We have followed all rules.

श्री वीरेन्द्र भाटिया : सर, यह देश के वित्त मंत्री जी के खिलाफ आरोप है, उस पर जांच होनी चाहिए ...(**व्यवधान**)... देश के वित्त मंत्री के खिलाफ इतना गंभीर आरोप लगाया गया है यह उनकी विश्वसनीयता पर आरोप है ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : यह सही नहीं है, यह सही नहीं है । ...(**व्यवधान**)... आप बैठ जाइए ...(**व्यवधान**)... आपका गया । ...(**व्यवधान**)... नोटिस देने के बाद डिस्कस करो । ...(**व्यवधान**)... You have given notice. But, it has not been accepted..*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI RAVULA CHANDRA SEKAR REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, they should be allowed...*(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House is adjourned till 2.00 p.m.

The House then adjourned at forty-one minutes past one of the clock

The House re-assembled after lunch at two of the clock, MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN in the Chair

CERTAIN MATTERS PUBLISHED IN THE BOOK TITLED 'VEDANTA'S BILLIONS'

श्री अमर सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश) : माननीय उपसभापति महोदय । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI. SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK (Goa): Has the notice been, given, Sir?

श्री अमर सिंह : माननीय उपसभापति महोदय । ...(**व्यवधान**)... माननीय उपसभापति महोदय, बहुत-बहुत धन्यवाद। आज सवेरे एक गंभीर मामला उठाया गया है । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: Has the notice been given, Sir?

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The Chairman has permitted him. *...(Interruptions)...* It has been allowed by the Chairman. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SHANTARAM LAXMAN NAIK: I just wanted to know whether he has given the notice or not. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am telling you that the Chairman has permitted him. Let us not argue on that. He will make his point just for two-three minutes. I am allowing him.

श्री अमर सिंह : धन्यवाद उपसभापति जी । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : आप दो-तीन मिनट में समाप्त कर दीजिएगा।

श्री अमर सिंह : उपसभापति महोदय, मैं यहां पर कोई आरोप लगाने के लिए नहीं खड़ा हुआ हूं और ना ही आपने साथी सदस्यों को उत्तेजित करने के लिए खड़ा हुआ हूं । श्री पी. चिदम्बरम देश के माननीय वित्त मंत्री हैं और मैं हृदय की गहराइयों से उनका सम्मान करता हूं पहले भी एक बार जब वह वित्त मंत्री थे, * ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : आप contents में मत जाइये ।

श्री अमर सिंह : सर, मैं contents में नहीं जा रहा हूं ।

श्री उपसभापति : आप contents में मत जाइये । ...(**व्यवधान**)... एक मिनट, एक मिनट । क्योंकि आप एक माननीय मंत्री मे बारे में कुछ कह रहे हैं । आपको सिर्फ मेंशन करने के लिए परमिशन दी गई हैं , इसके लिए आपको प्रोपर नोटिस देना पडेगा । आप नोटिस दे दीजिए । मैं आपके ज्ञान के लिए बताना चाहता हूं कि आपके द्वारा जो नोटिस दिया गया है, वह उनके पास भेज दिया गया है ....।

श्री अमर सिंह : सर, मैंने चेयर का आदर करते हुए बात मान ली है । मैं सिर्फ इतना कहना चाहता हूं कि कुछ आरोप लगे हैं । हो सकता है, वे आरोप गलत हो, अगर वे आरोप गलत हैं, तो बात खत्म हो जायेगी । अगर वे आरोप सत्य है और यह बात निकली, तो बहुत दूर तक जायेगी । मैं सिर्फ इतना ही कहना चाहता हूं कि उन आरोपों का सत्यापन हो जाए * में चाहता हूं कि उनकी प्रतिष्ठा का, उनकी गरिमा * दिन दूना रात चौगुना बढ़े । इसलिए मैं चाहता हूं कि दूध का दूध और पानी का पानी हो जाये और इस पुस्तक की जांच हो जाए। जो परम्परा है, कृष्णमाचारी का हरिदास मुंद्रा कांड हुआ था और तत्कालीन प्रधान मंत्री ने तत्कालीन वित्त मंत्री कृष्णमाचारी को कहा था कि हरिदास मुंद्रा कांड की जब तक विवेचना हो रही है तब तक वह वित्त मत्री के पद पर न रहें । मुझे पूरी उम्मीद है कि सच्चाई और पारदर्शिता के और उदारीकरण के धारक हमारे वित्त मंत्री अपनी शानदार परम्परा का, कांग्रेस की परम्परा का निर्वहन करेंगे। ...(**व्यवधान**)... वह निश्चित रूप से जब तक जांच होगी * ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : आप contents पर मत जाइये । ...(**व्यवधान**)... contents को निकाल दीजिए । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): Sir, I have a point of order. *...(Intrruptbns)...*

श्री उपसभापति : मैंने contents को निकाल दिया है । I have removed it. Which is just mentioned.

कार्मिक, लोक शिकायत और पेंशन मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री तथा संसदीय कार्य मंत्रालय में राज्य मंत्री (श्री सुरेश पचौरी) : सर, माननीय सदस्य ने जो बात उठाई है, मैं सोचता हूं कि उसके दो भाग है, एक जिनसे संबंधित उठाये हैं, वह है और दूसरे जो उठाये हैं वह हैं । पहला प्रश्न यह है कि जिनसे संबंधित उठाये हैं, हमारी रूल बुक में एक प्रक्रिया है । Rule 238(a) of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business says that prior intimation

---

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

to the Chairman and the concerned Minister - I repeat 'concerned Minister' - should be given before making any allegation against him. इसलिए पहले सूचना देना आवश्यक होता है । यह रूल पोजीशन है। मान्यवर, जहां तक रूलिंग का प्रश्न है, जो रूलिंग है – 158, जो हमारी रूलिंग बुक के 124 वें पेज पर है, उसमें इस बात को स्पष्ट कहा गया है कि "Prior notice to be given to the Member against whom allegation is made." मैं यह निवदेन करना चाहता हूं कि मैं इस व्याख्या में नहीं जाना चाहता हूं कि क्या सही है, क्या गलत है परन्तु जिसके बारे में बोला जाये उसे सम्बन्धित सदस्यों को दे दिया जाए इस समय ऐसा नहीं हुआ अतः इसको रिकार्ड में ना लाया जाये और अभी Expunge करा जाए, यह मेरी आपसे प्रार्थना है ।

श्री उपसभापति : आपने सही कहा है, मैं मैंबर्स को वहीं बता रहा हूं । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री वी0 नारायणसामी : सर, मेरा प्वांइट ऑफ ऑर्डर है । Sir, I would like to raise a point of order. As the hon. Minister said, when any allegation is made *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If he has said that..... *(Interruptbns)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, let me complete it. *...(Interruptions)..A* am telling it in a different form. *...(Interruptbns)...*

श्री सुरेन्द्र लाठ (उड़ीसा) **:** सर, अगर जीरों ऑवर चल रहा है तो हमें भी अपनी बात ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : जीरो ऑवर नहीं चल रहा है । Please *... (Interruptions)...* I have made it very clear. *...(Interruptbns)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, when the allegations are made against a Member or a Minister, Chairman has to give permission and it has to be intimated to the concerned Minister. After getting the reply from the Minister, the issue can be raised in the House. Therefore, I would like to submit that whatever he has spoken in this House, without getting a proper reply from the Minister, it should not go on record. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have made it very clear that the Chairman had permitted him because it was a question raised in the Zero Hour. Chairman had permitted, so, whatever he wanted to submit was allowed. But, I have said very carefully, if you have observed, that no book should be referred, no allegation should be made and he has ... *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Sir, he has made allegation against the Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Kindly go through the record. ...*(Interruptions)*... He teas made allegation against the Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*... Kindly go through the record, Sir. ..*(Interruptions)*... Sir, he questioned the integrity of the Finance Minister. You kindly go through the records. ...*(Intrruptions)*...

श्री मंगनी लाल मंडल (बिहार) **:** महोदय

श्री उपसभापति : जरा ठहरिए । ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री मंगनी लाल मंडल : नाम लिया है ...(**व्यवधान**)... आपने अनुमति नहीं दी, बिना नोटिस दिए ...(**व्यवधान**)... वित्त मंत्री का नाम लिया है, और इन्होंने कहा है कि ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री उपसभापति : उनको नोटिस देने के लिए गए ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री मंगनी लाल मंडल : वित्त मंत्री को सूचना देनी चाहिए थी इसलिए उसे निकाला जाना चाहिए ।

श्री उपसभापति : मैं रिकॉर्ड देखूंगा और जो रूल्स के खिलाफ होगा ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री मंगनी लाल मंडल : नारायणसामी जी का कहना बिल्कुल ठीक है। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

PROF. P.J. KURIEN (Kerala): Sir, let me say one sentence. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kurien, I am going to look into the record.. ...*(Interruptions)*... Rest assured .....*(Interruptions)*... I can make out what you want to say. ...*(Interruptions)*... I have made the position very clear. ...*(Interruptions)*...

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Sir, let me complete one sentence. What I am saying is that it is true that the Chairman has allowed him to raise the matter. That is correct. So, he raised it. But in raising so, if he has made any allegation against any Minister, since it is against the rules, it should be expunged. ...*(Interruptions)*... It should be expunged. ...*(Interruptions)*... I am only saying that. ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, you have made your point. ...*(Interruptions)*...

PROF. P.J. KURIEN: Sir, reference to the Minister, and the allegation, direct or indirect, that part should be expunged. *...(Interruptions)...* That is what I am saying. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Kurien, please sit down, I will tell you. *...(Interruptions)...* I made it very clear that I will look into it and if it is against the rules, I will expunge it. *...(Interruptions)...* I have made it very clear. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: You made it very clear, but in spite of that he raised the issue. *...(Interruptions)...* That is the point I would like to raise. *...(Interruptions)...* Even after your observation, he made allegation against the Finance Minister. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will have to go through the record. *...(Interruptions)...* Which portion, Mr. Narayanasamy? *...(Interruptions)...* Please listen, Mr. Narayanasamy. He has been allowed to make a mention. I cannot stop that because the Chairman has allowed him. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: But it should be within the rules. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy *...(Interruptions)...* I am making it clear. *...(Interruptions)...* Mr. Narayanasamy *...(Interruptions)...* The problem with you is that you don't listen. Please listen. *...(Interruptions)...* You please listen. *...(Interruptions)...* Just listen, Mr. Narayanasamy. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: This is not my problem. *...(Interruptions)...* It is the problem with Mr. Amar Singh. *...(Interruptions)...* He does not listen to your observation. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, you please listen *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI AMAR SINGH: I am inspired by the conduct of my colleagues. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Narayanasamy, please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Now, Shri Penumalli Madhu. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI N. JOTHI (Tamil Nadu): Sir, I will just take one minute. *...(Interruptions)...* Only one minute.

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I will not allow. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI N. JOTHI: Sir, I want one minute only. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I will not allow. *...(Interruptions)...* No; no. *...(Interruptions)...* This is wrong. *...(Interruptions)...* He is a Member. In his own right he can put a question. *...(Intenvpttons)...* All of you should not get up and support him. *...(Interruptions)...*No; no. *...(Interruptions)...* Don't follow certain wrong things. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI N. JOTHI: Sir, please give me only one minute. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have not given permission to anybody. *...(Interruptions)...* Don't make allegation against the Chair. *...(Interruptions)...* Don't make allegation against the Chair. *...(Interruptions)...* It is wrong. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI N. JOTHI: Sir, Mr. Pachouri has said, if an allegation is made against a Minister, prior notice should be given for that. Sir, three months ago, I had given a notice; not only one notice; I had given five notices. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't know anything about that. I will have to look into it. *...(Interruptions)...* That has nothing to do with it. *...(Interruptions)...* That has nothing to do with this subject. *...(Interruptions)...* No; no; why are you *...(Interruptions)...* Mr. Jothi, it is not relevant to the subject. *...(Interruptions)...* Please. That is not relevant to it. *...(Interruptions)...* I have ruled that it is not relevant to the subject. *...(Interruptions)...* Now, we shall take up the discussion on the Bill. *...(Interruptions)...* I have not allowed that. *...(Interruptions)...* That will not go on record. *...(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: As per the Rule position, it is for the Presiding Officer to take a decision. *...(Interruptions)...* I have simply spoken about the rule. *...(Interruptions)...*

MR. DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Jothi, it has nothing to do with the subject. *...(Interruptions)...* No; no; I am not allowing. *...(Interruptions)...* No; no; nothing will go on record. *...(Interruptions)...* Mr. Madhu, please start your speech on Food Safety and Standards Bill, 2006. We have taken up the Bill. *...(Interruptions)...* Nothing will go on record. *...(Interruptions)...*

Nothing will go on record. *...(Interruptions)...* No; nothing is going on record. *...(Interruptions)...* Nothing is going on record. *...(Interruptions)...* Please sit down. *...(Interruptions)...* Please sit down.

GOVERNMENT BILLS

The Food Safety and Standards Bill. 2006 - *Contd.*

SHRI PENUMALLI MADHU (Andhra Pradesh): Sir, I rise to spe-on the Bill which we are discussing, the Food Safety and Standards Bill, 2006.

Sir, if we see the core aspect of the Bill, I find this Bill helps the large producers by tightening the screws on the small traders, manufacturers, vendors and distributors. Sir, if this Bill is accepted in its present form, we are going to create such a situation wherein a number of small manufacturers, vendors and small distributors are all going to be unemployed. This Bill has not taken into consideration the real problem of the small traders, small manufacturers and distributors. It has not taken into consideration the problems that they are facing.

Sir, in order to understand this Bill, we have to look into one aspect. After drafting this Bill, the Group of Ministers gave a notice to the media. Sir, the Press published the item in the month of January this year. If we see the idea that is carried out in the notice, we will find that the motive behind the Bill is very much visible. Is it really meant for safety standards? Or, is it meant to help the big manufacturers? It is very much clear here.

Sir, in the Notice, that has been published in the Press, it is mentioned that a draft integrated Food Law has been prepared which is intended to be contemporary, comprehensive and meet the dynamic requirements of international trade and Indian food trade industry. Who has drafted this Bill? After reading this, a doubt arises as to whether the Indian Industry drafted it or the Government of India drafted it!

Sir, according to me there are five important aspects dealt with in this Bill. If we look into these aspects, we would come to know how this Bill is helping the big manufacturers and eliminating the small traders.